

## Tafsir Dergisi - Tafsir Journal

e-ISSN: 2792-078X

Cilt/Volume: 3, Sayı/Issue: 2 (Kasım/ November 2023): 78-87

### **Beyzâvî'nin Tefsirinde “Bunu, şu şekilde okuyanların kıraati de destekler.” İfadesi Bağlamında Tilavet Fenomeni**

The Phenomenon of Recitation in Bayḍāwī's Tafsir in the Context of the Expression “And it is supported by the recitation of those who recited.”

#### **Murat Kayacan**

Prof. Dr. İzmir Kâtip Çelebi Üniversitesi, İlahiyat Fakültesi/ Tefsir Ana Bilim Dalı

İzmir Kâtip Çelebi University, Faculty of Theology

İzmir, Türkiye

e-mail: dr.muratkayacan@gmail.com

orcid.org/ 0000-0003-2131-0692

#### **Makale Bilgisi/Article Information**

#### **Araştırma Makalesi/Research Article**

**Geliş Tarihi/Received:** 28.09.2023

**Kabul Tarihi/Accepted:** 10.11.2023

**Yayın Tarihi/Pub Date:** 30.11.2023

#### **Atıf/Cite as**

Kayacan, Murat. The Phenomenon of Recitation in Bayḍāwī's Tafsir in the Context of the Expression “And it is supported by the recitation of those who recited.”, Tafsir Dergisi 3/2 (Kasım 2023), 78-87

Kayacan, Murat. The Phenomenon of Recitation in Bayḍāwī's Tafsir in the Context of the Expression “And it is supported by the recitation of those who recited.”, Tafsir Journal 3/2 (November 2023), 78-87

#### **İntihal/Plagiarism**

Bu makale, en az iki hakem tarafından incelendi ve intihal içermediği teyit edildi/This article has been reviewed by at least two referees and scanned via a plagiarism software. Published by Tafsir Journal, Turkey. <http://www.tafsirdergisi.com/index.php/tafsir/index>

Bu eser Creative Commons Atıf-GayriTicari 4.0 Uluslararası Lisansı ile lisanslanmıştır.

## Beyzâvî'nin Tefsirinde “Bunu, şu şekilde okuyanların kıraati de destekler.” İfadesi Bağlamında Tilavet Fenomeni

### Özet

Kıraat ilmi, Kuran'daki farklı okuyuşları ve bunların nasıl yorumlanması gerektiğini incelemektedir. Bu farklı okuyuşlar, Kuran'ın farklı ağız ve lehçelerde okunmasına ve farklı vurgu ve telaffuz şekillerine sahip olmasıyla ilişkilidir. Bu makale kıraat konusunu, tefsirin yanında Eş'arî kelamı ve Şâfiî fıkhında da mümtaz bir yere sahip olan Nâsîrüddîn Ebû Saîd el-Beyzâvî'nin (ö. 685/1286) *Envârü't-tenzîl ve esrârü't-te'vîl* adlı eseri bağlamında ele alacaktır. Söz konusu tefsir, bir îcaz (ihtisar) hârikası ve Beyzâvî'nin tefsircilik yeteneğini en iyi gösteren kaynak olarak kabul edilir. Bu eserde Beyzâvî önceki önemli tefsir kitaplarını başarılı bir şekilde özetlemiş ve kendi yorumlarını sunmuştur. Ayrıca, ayetlerin yorumlarına ek olarak, dilbilgisi kurallarına dayalı açıklamalarıyla da büyük bir tefsir bilgisi sergilemiştir. Bu eserde kıraat konusu epeyce bir yer tutmaktadır. Bu nedenle eserde kıraatlerin birbirlerini destekleyici rolü, eserde altı defa geçen “Bunu, ... şeklinde okuyanın okuyuşu da destekler. (ويؤيده قراءة من قرأ)” ifadesi ile sınırlı olarak ele alınacaktır. Bu araştırma, Beyzâvî'nin tefsirindeki kıraatin yeri konusunda literatürdeki belirgin boşluğun doldurulmasına mikro düzeyde bir inceleme ile katkı sunmayı amaçlamaktadır. Bu konunun daha önce özellikle de söz konusu ifade bağlamında ele alınmamış olması, araştırmanın özgünlüğünün kanıtı olarak görülebilir. Her ne kadar metnin daha geniş tasarımı ve amacını göz ardı edebileceği için her zaman risk taşıdığı söylene de araştırma sırasında metinlerarasılık yöntemi kullanılmıştır. Zira bu yöntem, daha kapsamlı bir perspektif sunmak için gayet işlevseldir. Ek olarak metinler arasındaki ilişkileri, etkileşimleri ve referansları incelemek, farklı metinler arasındaki benzerlikleri, alıntıları, göndermeleri ve temasları analiz etmeye yardımcı olmaktadır. Bu makalede ayrıca Beyzâvî'nin tefsirinde kıraatin rolü, onun kıraat literatürünü tefsir alanında ne şekilde kullandığı, onun dikkat çektiği kıraat farklılıkları konusunda diğer tefsirlerde ve kıraat konulu eserlerdeki tercihler ve açıklamalar ele alınarak tefsir ve kıraat literatürüne katkıda bulunulmuştur. Elde edilen bulgulara göre, “ويؤيده قراءة من قرأ” ifadesini kullanan Beyzâvî, kıraate odaklanırken kıraatin sahibini belirtme konusuna daha az yoğunlaşmaktadır. Kıraatler hakkında bilgi verirken bu tür belirsiz ifadeler kullanmak sadece ona özgü değildir ve diğer alimlerin eserlerinde de bu tür ifadeler bulunur. Farklı kıraatlerin aynı anlamları destekleme rolünü vurgulamak için Beyzâvî, söz konusu ifadeyi Medine'de inen bir surede üç kez (al-Baqara) ve Mekke'de inen farklı surelerde (Yûnus, al-Ra'd ve al-Kahf) üç kez kullanır. Diğer tefsir bilgileri ile karşılaştırılarak, gelecek araştırmalarda Beyzâvî'nin bazı kıraat imamlarının kıraatlerini özellikle belirleyip belirlemediği ve bu kıraatler arasında tercihlerde bulunup bulunmadığı araştırılabilir. Ayrıca, Beyzâvî'nin tefsirinde anlamı etkileyen veya etkilemeyen kıraatlerin yeri de incelenebilir.

**Keywords:** Tefsir, Kıraat, Kur'an, Beyzâvî, Envârü't-tenzîl.

### The Phenomenon of Recitation in Bayḍāwī's Tafsir in the Context of the Expression “And it is supported by the recitation of those who recited.”

### Abstract

The science of qirā'a examines the various recitations and how they should be interpreted in the Qur'ān. These different recitations are associated with the Qur'ān being recited in different dialects and accents, as well as having different emphasis and pronunciation styles. This article focuses on qirā'a within the context of the work *Anwār al-tanzîl wa-asrār al-ta'wîl* by Nāṣir al-Dīn al-Bayḍāwī (d. 685/1286), who holds a prominent place in Ash'arī theology and Shāfi'ī jurisprudence, in addition to his contributions to commentary. The mentioned commentary is considered a marvel of conciseness (i'jaz) and one of the most important sources that demonstrate Bayḍāwī's expertise in commentary. The qirā'a subject plays a significant role in this work. Therefore, this research aims to contribute to filling a noticeable gap in the literature regarding the place of qirā'a in Bayḍāwī's commentary through a micro-level examination. This article will specifically focus on the role of qirā'a as suggested by the expression “ويؤيده قراءة من قرأ” that occurs six times in his work, limiting the scope to how these recitations mutually support each other. The fact that this topic, especially within the context of the expression “ويؤيده قراءة من قرأ” has not been previously addressed, can be considered as evidence of the originality of this research. Although it is said that using the intertextuality method during research can sometimes risk ignoring the broader design and purpose of the text, this method has been employed in this study. This is because this method is quite functional for providing a more comprehensive perspective. Furthermore, it helps examine the relationships, interactions, and references

between texts and analyze similarities, quotations, references, and themes among different texts. Additionally, this article delves into the role of qirā'a in Bayḍāwī's commentary, how he utilizes qirā'a literature in the field of commentary, and his preferences and explanations regarding qirā'a variations that he finds noteworthy in comparison to other exegetes. According to the findings, in the expression "ويؤيده قراءة من قرأ" Bayḍāwī focuses more on the manner of recitation rather than specifying the reciter. These types of ambiguous transmissions are not unique to him and can also be found in the works of other scholars. To emphasize the supportive role of the qira'at in relation to each other in meaning, Bayḍāwī uses this expression three times in a Medinan sūra (al-Baqara) and three times in different Meccan sūras (Yūnus, al-Ra'd, and al-Kahf). By comparing with the other exegetes, future researches can explore whether Bayḍāwī specifically mentioned the recitations of certain qirā'a imams, whether he made preferences among these recitations or not. Additionally, the significance of recitations that do or do not affect the meaning in Bayḍāwī's commentary can be examined.

**Keywords:** Tafsir, Qirā'a, Qur'ān, Bayḍāwī, Anwār al-tanzīl.

### Introduction

Qira'at is the plural of qira'a. In terminology, there is a doctrine followed by one of the imams of the reciters who differs from others in the pronunciation of the Holy Qur'ān, with the narrations and paths agreeing on it, whether this disagreement is in the pronunciation of the letters or in the pronunciation of their forms (النطق).<sup>1</sup> While there have been studies conducted on Bayḍāwī (ö. 685/1286), there is a noticeable gap in the literature regarding the place of recitation (qirā'a) in his tafsir. Therefore, it can be confidently stated that this research contributes to the fields of tafsir and recitation. To achieve this goal, this article presents a specific study within the context of the phrase "And it is supported by the recitation of those who recited (ويؤيده قراءة من قرأ)" in Bayḍāwī's tafsir. This research is limited to the discussion of recitation within the sections of Bayḍāwī's exegetal work where this phrase, which was mentioned only six times in the commentary, appears.

In order to determine the place of recitation in Bayḍāwī's tafsir, the intertextuality method will be employed. Although this method always carries a risk because focusing merely on the intertextual aspects of the material may overlook the larger design and purpose of the material.<sup>2</sup> However, for a comprehensive perspective, intertextuality is certainly beneficial.

After giving a brief information about Bayḍāwī and his tafsir named *Anwar at-tanzil wa asrar at-ta'wil* based on literature analysis, this article will primarily seek to provide answers to the following questions: "What is the role of recitations in Bayḍāwī's commentary? What recitation contributions can be derived from Bayḍāwī's commentary? Does Bayḍāwī's commentary contain a significant difference in terms of recitation compared to other commentaries and classical books on recitation? What was the influence of Bayḍāwī's commentary on subsequent Qur'ānic scholarship, both within and outside the Islamic tradition?"

### The Controversial Commentator Bayḍāwī and His Commentary

While some scholars have suggested that Bayḍāwī's philosophical and religious ideas have entered a period of decline, there are others who view it as a transitional phase, a place for intellectual preparation, and the starting point for innovative and imaginative future developments.<sup>3</sup> He was brilliant but impatient and severe jurist. He was initially removed from his position by a regional governor, but the imperial court in Tabrīz reinstated him as the Qāḍī al-Quḍāt of Shīrāz around the year 680/1281. Regrettably, his decisions had caused significant dissatisfaction, leading to the abrupt end of his judicial career in Shiraz in 681/1282, just six months after his reinstatement.<sup>4</sup>

Bayḍāwī, who preoccupied with the Mu'tazilism,<sup>5</sup> in his interpretation *Anwār al-tanzīl wa-asrār al-ta'wīl*, addressed the theological aspects related to Mu'tazilites in the field of tafsir. This work

---

<sup>1</sup> Muḥammad 'Abd al-'Azīm al-Zurqāni, *Manāhil al-'Irfān fi 'ulūm al-Qur'ān* (Cairo: Maṭba'at 'Īsā al-Bābī al-Ḥalabī wa-Shurakāh, n.d.), 1/412.

<sup>2</sup> Ben Witherington, *Torah Old and New Exegesis, Intertextuality, and Hermeneutics* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2018), 175.

<sup>3</sup> Edwin Elliott Calverley - James W. Pollock (eds.), *Nature Mand and God in Medieval Islam* (Leiden: Brill, 2002), 1/xxi.

<sup>4</sup> Calverley - Pollock, *Nature Mand and God in Medieval Islam*, 1/xxxii-xxxiii.

<sup>5</sup> Andrew J. Lane, 'You Can't Tell a Book by Its Author: A Study of Mu'tazilite Theology in al-Zamakhsharī's (d. 538/1144) *Kashshāf*', *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London* 75/1 (2012), 48.

gained recognition and became well-known. Scholars showed interest in it, and it was studied for its depth and complexities. Academics and scholars, as well as subsequent generations, found value in studying and preserving it.<sup>6</sup> Baydâwî's commentary on the Qur'ân is considered his most notable work and has received recognition from scholars, both within and outside the Muslim faith. This recognition is a result of the extensive analysis and examination carried out by subsequent Muslim scholars, setting it apart from other commentaries.<sup>7</sup>

The purpose of writing *Anwâr al-tanzîl wa-asrâr al-ta'wîl* was to supplant al-Zamakhsharî's Mu'tazilite interpretations and offer a more universally beneficial orthodox commentary that includes comprehensive annotations.<sup>8</sup> This is a significant book, rich in content, in which he summarized from (*al-Kashshâf*) matters related to grammar, meanings, and expression.<sup>9</sup> Calverley points out how useful Baydâwî's Qur'ân commentary is to Muslim and non-Muslim scholars alike in their study of Islam.<sup>10</sup> Additionally, Jalâl ad-Din al-Suyûtî's (d. 91 1/1505) introduction to his own gloss, *Hashiyah on al Baydâwî's Qur'ân* commentary was written over a long period of time and completed in 900/1494, this introduction (*Hashiyah on al Baydâwî*) brings the history of the reception of *al-Kashshâf* to the eve of the demise of the Mamluk Sultanate, which ended in 922.<sup>11</sup>

al-Baydâwî, who lived until 685/1286, made the deliberate choice to compose his commentary, *Anwar al-tanzil*, with the intention of competing with *al-Kashshâf* as the primary textbook for tafsir. In contrast to *al-Kashshâf*, Baydâwî's commentary did not include Mu'tazilite elements and adhered to Ash'arite theology. This commentary was evidently created to fulfill the demand for a suitable Sunni Ash'arite tafsir textbook.<sup>12</sup> al-Suyûtî regarded Baydâwî's Qur'ân commentary, *Anwâr al-tanzîl*, as a condensed version of *al-Kashshâf* and a significant part of its reception history. He asserted that Baydâwî meticulously removed all Mu'tazilite and unorthodox content from *al-Kashshâf* and made valuable additions to it, ultimately enhancing its quality to a state of perfection.<sup>13</sup>

Different from al-Suyûtî, Saçaklızade, who accuses Islamic philosophers of blasphemy and associating partners with God, accuses Baydâwî of a grave error for incorporating their views into his works without criticism.<sup>14</sup> Baydâwî's commentary is also referred to as “Mukhtaşar al-Kashshâf”.<sup>15</sup> While this description may imply a diminishing view of Baydâwî's tafsir, the unquestionable value of the tafsir remains.

Although the expression “ويؤيد ذلك قراءة من قرأ” used once in al-Zamakhsharî's tafsir<sup>16</sup> closely resembles the phrase “ويؤيده قراءة من قرأ”, which is to be discussed in this article, nevertheless it is not composed exactly of the same wording. The table below provides information about the verses and chapters where Baydâwî used his own phrase to provide recitation knowledge:

**Table 1. Verses and Chapters with Baydâwî's Phrase “ويؤيده قراءة من قرأ”**

Sûrah Name	Sûrah No	Verse No	Meccan/Medinan
al-Baqara	2	22	Madînan
al-Baqara	2	177	Madînan
al-Baqara	2	196	Madînan

<sup>6</sup> 'Abd al-Rahmân ibn Abî Bakr Suyûtî Jalâl al-Dîn al-, *Nawâhid al-abkâr wa-shawârid al-afkâr* (Saudi Arabia: Jâmi'at Umm al-Qurâ-Kulliyat al-Da'wah wa-Uşûl al-Dîn, 1424/2005), 1/13.

<sup>7</sup> Lutpi Ibrahim, 'al-Baydâwî's Life and Works', *Islamic Studies* 18/4 (1979), 316.

<sup>8</sup> Calverley - Pollock, *Nature Mand and God in Medieval Islam*, 1/xxxiii.

<sup>9</sup> Muştafâ ibn 'Abd Allâh Kâtib Jalabî, *Kashf al-Zunûn 'an Asâmi al-Kutub wa-al-Funûn* (Baghdâd: Maktabat al-Muthannâ, 1941), 1/186.

<sup>10</sup> Calverley - Pollock, *Nature Mand and God in Medieval Islam*, 1/xxi.

<sup>11</sup> Walid A. Saleh, 'The Gloss as Intellectual History: The Hâshiyahs on al-Kashshâf', *Oriens* 41/3/4 (2013), 220.

<sup>12</sup> Saleh, 'The Gloss as Intellectual History', 228.

<sup>13</sup> Saleh, 'The Gloss as Intellectual History', 237.

<sup>14</sup> Celil Kiraz, 'Saçaklızâde Mehmed Efendî'nin Beyzâvî'ye Yönelik Eleştirileri', *Uludağ Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 15/1 (2006), 361.

<sup>15</sup> 'Abd al-Rahmân ibn Abî Bakr Suyûtî Jalâl al-Dîn al-, *Bughyat al-wu'âh fi ṭabaqât al-lughawiyîn wa-al-nuḥḥâh*, critical ed. Muḥammad Abû al-Faḍl Ibrâhîm (Lebanon: al-Maktabah al-'Aşriyah, no date), 2/50.

<sup>16</sup> Abû al-Qâsim Mahmûd ibn 'Umar al-Zamakhsharî, *al-Kashshâf 'an ḥaqâ'iq gavamid at-tanzîl wa uyun al-aqawil fi vucûhi't-ta'wîl* (Beirut: Dâr al-Kitab al-'Arabî, 1407/1986), 4/814.

al-Yūnus	10	4	Meccan
al-Ra'd	13	43	Meccan
al-Kahf	18	18	Meccan

### The Recitations of **الْفَمَرَاتِ (fruits)** and **الْفَمَرَة (fruit)** in the Chapter al-Baqara 2/22

Only the creator, who created the sky as a well-constructed canopy,<sup>17</sup> can be God:<sup>18</sup>

{  
 الَّذِي جَعَلَ لَكُمُ الْأَرْضَ فِرَاشًا وَالسَّمَاءَ بِنَاءً وَأَنْزَلَ مِنَ السَّمَاءِ مَاءً فَأَخْرَجَ بِهِ مِنَ الثَّمَرَاتِ رِزْقًا لَكُمْ فَلَا تَجْعَلُوا لِلَّهِ أَنْدَادًا وَأَنْتُمْ تَعْلَمُونَ  
 ) Who has appointed the earth a resting-place for you, and the sky a canopy; and caused water to pour down from the sky, thereby producing fruits (الْفَمَرَاتِ) as food for you. And do not set up rivals to Allah when you know (better)." (al-Baqara 2/22). Bayḍāwī interprets the mention of "fruits" (al-thamarāt / الْفَمَرَاتِ) in the verse as an indication of abundance.<sup>19</sup> He notes that the term مِنْ الثَّمَرَاتِ is used in the singular form مِنَ الثَّمَرَة in the recitation of those who read it this way, and it supports the same meaning. In other words, الْفَمَرَاتِ (fruits) and الثَّمَرَة (fruit) can be interchangeable forms for plurality. Bayḍāwī presents these two recitations to emphasize that both convey the same meaning."<sup>20</sup> Similarly, the Qur'ān says, *wamā tahmilu min unthā* (وَمَا تَحْمِلُ مِنْ أُنْثَى) (al-Fāṭir 35/11). In this verse, "woman" is used, but it refers to "women".<sup>21</sup> Rāzī asks: "The fruits produced by the water from the sky are abundant. So, why is it said "الْفَمَرَاتِ" instead of "الْفَمَر" or "الْفَمَار"? He answers: To emphasize the scarcity of worldly fruits and to indicate the significance of the situation of the Hereafter.<sup>22</sup> Rāzī points out the difference between jam' al-qillah and jam' al-taksīr. These examples illustrate how the recitation of certain words in the Qur'ān, either in plural or singular form, can convey the same meaning.

### The Recitations of "البِر" (al-birr) and "البَرَّ" (al-bārr) in the Chapter al-Baqara 2/177

People of the Book scholars give importance to the formal aspects of worship rituals, but these rituals do not penetrate their inner selves or affect their behavior. They consider the form of religion to be the essence of religion itself. However, Allah has criticized their attitude and narrow view, exposing their misunderstanding of religion:<sup>23</sup>

لَيْسَ الْبِرُّ أَنْ تُولُّوا وُجُوهَكُمْ قِبَلَ الْمَشْرِقِ وَالْمَغْرِبِ وَلَكِنَّ الْبِرَّ مَنْ آمَنَ بِاللَّهِ وَالْيَوْمِ الْآخِرِ وَالْمَلَائِكَةِ وَالْكِتَابِ وَالنَّبِيِّينَ وَآتَى الْمَالَ عَلَى حُبِّهِ ذَوِي الْقُرْبَىٰ وَالْيَتَامَىٰ وَالْمَسْكِينِ وَابْنَ السَّبِيلِ وَالسَّائِلِينَ وَفِي الرِّقَابِ وَأَقَامَ الصَّلَاةَ وَآتَى الزَّكَاةَ وَالْمُوفُونَ بِعَهْدِهِمْ إِذَا عَاهَدُوا وَالصَّابِرِينَ فِي الْبَأْسَاءِ وَالصَّرَاءِ وَجِينَ النَّاسِ أُولَٰئِكَ الَّذِينَ صَدَقُوا وَأُولَٰئِكَ هُمُ الْمُتَّقُونَ  
*It is not righteousness (البِرُّ) that you turn your faces to the east and the west; but righteous is he who believes in Allah and the Last Day and the angels and the Scripture and the Prophets; and gives his wealth, for love of Him, to kinsfolk and to orphans and the needy and the wayfarer and to those who ask, and to set slaves free; and observes proper worship and pays the poor due. And those who keep their treaty when they make one, and the patient in tribulation and adversity and time of stress. Such are they who are sincere. Such are the God fearing.*" (al-Baqara 2/177).

The word "البِرُّ" (al-birr) in the verse above is a maṣdar placed in the position of a noun.<sup>24</sup> Bayḍāwī says that goodness (البِرُّ) is not limited to what you are currently doing (turning towards the qiblah), as it has been abrogated, but rather goodness refers to what Allah has clarified, and the believers have followed. It is also said that it is general for both of them (Ahl al-Kitab and Muslims), that is, goodness is not restricted to the matter of the qiblah (the direction of prayer),

<sup>17</sup> Mujir al-Dīn ibn Muḥammad al-'Ulaymī, *Fath al-Raḥmān fī tafsīr al-Qur'ān*, critical ed. Nūr al-Dīn Ṭalīb (Beirut: Dār al-Nawādir, 1430/2009), 1/170.

<sup>18</sup> Jalāl al-Dīn Muḥammad ibn Aḥmad al-Maḥallī - Jalāl al-Dīn 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Abī Bakr al-Suyūṭī, *Tafsīr al-Jalālayn* (Cairo: Dār al-Ḥadīth, n.d.), 6.

<sup>19</sup> Nāṣir al-Dīn al-Bayḍāwī, *Anwār al-tanzīl wa-asrār al-ta'wīl*, critical ed. Muḥammad 'Abd al-Raḥmān al-Mar'ashlī (Beirut: Dār Iḥyā' al-Turāth al-'Arabī, 1418), 1/55.

<sup>20</sup> Bayḍāwī, *Anwār al-tanzīl wa-asrār al-ta'wīl*, 1/55.

<sup>21</sup> 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Muḥammad Ibn Zanjalah Abū Zur'ah, *Hujjat al-qirā'āt*, critical ed. Sa'īd al-Afghānī (Beirut: Dār al-Risālah, n.d.), 638.

<sup>22</sup> Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī, *Mafatih al-ghayb* (Beirut: Daru Iḥyāi al-Turās al-'Arabī, 1420/1999), 2/344.

<sup>23</sup> 'Abd al-Karīm Yūnus al-Khaṭīb, *al-Tafsīr al-Qur'ānī li al-Qur'ān* (Cairo: Dar al-Fikr al-'Arabī, n.d.), 1/192.

<sup>24</sup> Muḥammad ibn Jarīr al-Ṭabarī, *Jāmi' al-bayān fī tafsīr al-Qur'ān*, critical ed. 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abd al-Muḥsin al-Turkī (Beirut: Dār Hijr lil-Ṭibā'ah wa al-Nashr wa al-Tawzī' wa al-'Ilān, 1422/2001), 3/77.

or the great goodness that it is good for you to boast about.<sup>25</sup> Ḥamzah (h. 156/773) and Ḥaḥḥ read this word "وَلَكِنَّ الْبِرَّ" (walakinna al-birra) in the mansub case, meaning that the goodness to be observed is the goodness of the one who believes in Allah. Another possibility is that the phrase means "The one who possesses goodness is the believer." Bayḍāwī points out that the reading of this word as "الْبَارَّ" (al-bārr) also supports this meaning, but he finds the first interpretation (الْبِرَّ) more suitable and beautiful. When mentioning "the Book," the verse refers to the category of books, specifically the Qur'ān. Among the ten recitation imams, there is no one who reads the word البر (al-birr) in this verse as البار (al-bārr).<sup>26</sup> Darwaza<sup>27</sup> and Nasafi also mention that the word is read as "البار" (al-bārr) in this verse. However, unlike Bayḍāwī, they do not compare the two readings and make a preference.<sup>28</sup> None of the ten major Qur'ānic reciters read the word "البر" (al-birr) as "البار" (al-bārr) in this verse.<sup>29</sup> In summary, the textual variations and interpretations related to the word "البر" (al-birr) and its alternative "البار" (al-bārr) in this verse exemplify the nuanced nature of Qur'ānic recitations.

#### The Recitations of "وَأَتَمُّوا" (wa atimmū) and "وَأَقِيمُوا" (wa aqīmū) in the Chapter al-Baqara 2/196

Hajj is one of the five pillars of Islam and one of its fundamental obligatory acts. It was made obligatory as a Sunnah Mu'akkadah (emphasized or confirmed practice of the Prophet) in the sixth year after the Hijra (migration to Madina). 'Umrah, on the other hand, is also considered a religious duty in some Islamic schools of thought, similar to Hajj.<sup>30</sup>

وَأَتَمُّوا الْحَجَّ وَالْعُمْرَةَ لِلَّهِ فَإِنْ أُحْصِرْتُمْ فَمَا اسْتَيْسَرَ مِنَ الْهَدْيِ وَلَا تَخْلُقُوا رُؤُسَكُمْ حَتَّىٰ يَبْلُغَ الْهَدْيُ مَحَلَّهُ فَمَنْ كَانَ مِنْكُمْ مَّرِيضًا أَوْ بِهِ أَذًى مِنْ رَأْسِهِ فَفِدْيَةٌ مِنْ صِيَامٍ أَوْ صَدَقَةٍ أَوْ نُسُكٍ فَإِذَا أَمِنْتُمْ فَمِنَ تَمَتُّعٍ بِالْعُمْرَةِ إِلَى الْحَجِّ فَمَا اسْتَيْسَرَ مِنَ الْهَدْيِ فَمَنْ لَمْ يَجِدْ فَصِيَامًا ثَلَاثَةَ أَيَّامٍ فِي الْحَجِّ وَسَبْعَةً إِذَا رَجَعْتُمْ تِلْكَ عَشْرَةٌ كَامِلَةٌ ذَلِكَ لِمَنْ لَمْ يَكُنْ أَهْلَهُ حَاضِرِي الْمَسْجِدِ الْحَرَامِ وَالْعُقَابُ شَدِيدٌ الْعُقَابُ (وَأَتَمُّوا) And complete (وَأَقِيمُوا) the Hajj or 'Umrah in the service of Allah. But if you are prevented (From completing it), send an offering for sacrifice, such as you may find, and do not shave your heads until the offering reaches the place of sacrifice. And if any of you is ill, or has an ailment in his scalp, (Necessitating shaving), (he should) in compensation either fast, or feed the poor, or offer sacrifice; and when you are in peaceful conditions (again), if any one wishes to continue the 'Umrah on to the Hajj, he must make an offering, such as he can afford, but if he cannot afford it, he should fast three days during the Hajj and seven days on his return, making ten days in all. This is for those whose household is not in (the precincts of) the Sacred Mosque. And fear Allah, and know that Allah is strict in punishment." (al-Baqara 2/196).

Bayḍāwī, considering the mentioned verse above, emphasizes that the rituals of Hajj and 'Umrah must be performed completely for the sake of Allah's pleasure. According to him, this indicates that both Hajj and 'Umrah are obligatory. He also, like Nīsābūrī,<sup>31</sup> mentions that the recitation of the phrase "wa'atimmū al-ḥajja wā al-'umrata lillahi" as "wa'aqīmū al-ḥajja wa al-'umrata lillahi" supports this approach.<sup>32</sup>

#### The Recitations of "إِنَّهُ" (innehu) and "أَنَّهُ" (annahu) in the Chapter Yūnus 10/4

Allah initiated the first creation, and after death, people will indeed return to Him. If the return is to Him alone and not to anyone else, then true worship lies in recognizing this fact. Worshipping others is invalid:<sup>33</sup>

<sup>25</sup> Bayḍāwī, *Anwār al-tanzīl wa-asrār al-ta'wīl*, 1/121.

<sup>26</sup> Bayḍāwī, *Anwār al-tanzīl wa-asrār al-ta'wīl*, 1/121.

<sup>27</sup> Darwazah Muḥammad 'Izzat, *al-Tafsīr al-ḥadīth* (Cairo: Dār Iḥyā' al-Kutub al-'Arabīyah, 1383), 6/283.

<sup>28</sup> Abū al-Barakāt 'Abd Allāh ibn Aḥmad ibn Maḥmūd Ḥāfiẓ al-Dīn al-Nasafī, *Madārik al-tanzīl wa-ḥaqā'iq al-ta'wīl*, critical ed. Yūsuf 'Alī Badawī (Beirut: Dār al-Kalim al-Ṭayyib, 1419/1998), 1/153.

<sup>29</sup> 498-499. verses (بِخَلْفِ لَهُ فِي رَحْمَةٍ وَخَبِيئَةٍ ... وَرَفَعَكَ لَيْسَ الْبِرُّ يُصْنَبُ فِي غَلَا / وَلَكِنْ خَفِيْفٌ وَارْفَعِ الْبِرُّ عَمَّ فِي ... هِمَا وَمَوْصِنٌ تَقْلُهُ صَحَّ شَأْنُهُ) of al-Shāḥibīyah can be considered. See: Abū Muḥammad al-Shāḥibī, *Ḥirz al-amānī wa-wajh al-tahānī fī al-qirā'āt al-sab'*, critical ed. Muḥammad Tamīm al-Zu'bi (Damascus: Dār al-Ghawthānī li al-Dirasāt al-Qur'āniyyah, 1426/2005), 40.

<sup>30</sup> Wahbah ibn Muḥṣafā al-Zuhaylī, *al-Tafsīr al-munīr fī al-'aqidah wa-al-sharī'ah wa-al-manhaj* (Dimashq: Dār al-Fikr al-Mu'āshir, 1418/1997), 1/98.

<sup>31</sup> Niẓām al-Dīn al-Ḥasan ibn Muḥammad ibn Ḥusayn al-Qummī al-Nīsābūrī, *Gharā'ib al-Qur'ān wa-raqhā'ib al-furqān*, critical ed. Zakariyā 'Umayrāt (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1416), 1/136.

<sup>32</sup> Bayḍāwī, *Anwār al-tanzīl wa-asrār al-ta'wīl*, 1/129.

<sup>33</sup> Muḥammad al-Tāhir Ibn 'Āshūr, *al-Taḥrīr wa-al-tanwīr* (Tūnis: al-Dār al-Tūnisīyah li al-Nashr, 1984), 11/90.

إِلَيْهِ مَرْجِعُكُمْ جَمِيعًا وَعَدَّ اللَّهُ حَقًّا إِنَّهُ يَبْدُوا الْخَلْقَ ثُمَّ يُعِيدُهُ لِيَجْزِيَ الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّالِحَاتِ بِالْقِسْطِ وَالَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا لَهُمْ شَرَابٌ مِنْ (إِنَّهُ يَبْدُوا) Unto Him is the return of all of you; it is a promise of Allah in truth. Lo! He produces creation (إِنَّهُ يَبْدُوا), then reproduces it, that He may reward those who believe and do good works with equity; while, as for those who disbelieve, theirs will be a boiling drink and painful doom because they disbelieved." (Yūnus 10/4).

Bayḍāwī suggests that the phrase in the verse above "as for those who disbelieve, theirs will be a boiling drink and painful doom because they disbelieved" has been modified to emphasize the meaning of punishment. What is noteworthy is Allah's initiation of creation and the reward of individuals based on their deeds. The Almighty has undertaken to recompense the believers in accordance with His grace and generosity. Inflicting punishment on the disbelievers is akin to sending them an affliction due to their malicious beliefs and ominous deeds. This part seems to serve as the rationale for the opening sentence of the verse: "To Him will be your return - of all of you." (Yūnus10/4). What is implied here is the commencement of life and the restart of it after death, with everyone being held accountable for their actions by Allah. Bayḍāwī also indicates that this is supported by the reading of the person who reads the expression *innahu yabda'u* (إِنَّهُ يَبْدُوا) as *annahu yabda'u* (أَنَّهُ يَبْدُوا) in the verse. In this case, the meaning "Because He (initiates creation)" is obtained.<sup>34</sup> The alternative recitation mentioned by Bayḍāwī, which is available in al-Zamakhsharī's al-Kashshāf with the same comment,<sup>35</sup> is narrated from Abu Ja'far (d. 130/747-48). He read "إِنَّهُ يَبْدُوا" with the fatḥah meaning "That or because, to reward those who believe and do righteous deeds with justice. On the contrary, too hot water, and a painful punishment for those who disbelieve because they rejected the faith."<sup>36</sup>

#### The Recitations of "وَمَنْ عِنْدَهُ" (wa man 'indahu) "وَمِنْ عِنْدِهِ" (wa min 'indihi) in the Chapter al-Ra'd 13/43

The statements that involve the rejection of faith in the following verse are attributed to have been uttered by Ka'b ibn al-Ashraf,<sup>37</sup> idolaters, or all disbelievers:<sup>38</sup> "وَيَقُولُ الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا لَسْتَ مُرْسَلًا قُلْ (كَفَى بِاللَّهِ شَهِيدًا بَيْنِي وَبَيْنَكُمْ وَمَنْ عِنْدَهُ عِلْمُ الْكِتَابِ) They who disbelieve say: You are no messenger (of Allah). Say: Allah, and whosoever has (وَمَنْ عِنْدَهُ) true knowledge of the Scripture, is sufficient witness between me and you." (al-Ra'd 13/43). According to Bayḍāwī's narration, it is said that the term "disbelievers" in the verse refers to the Jewish leaders.<sup>39</sup> According to him the part "Say: 'Enough for a witness between me and you is Allah" in the verse points that Allah is the most definitive evidence of Muhammad's (pbuh) prophethood to the extent that there is no need for anyone else's testimony. The part "and (testimony of) such as have knowledge of the Book" refers to those who have knowledge of the Qur'ān and its miraculous composition or those who have knowledge of the Torah, such as 'Abd Allāh Ibn Salām (d. 43/663-64) and others like him. Alternatively, it refers to the one who possesses knowledge of the Preserved Tablet (*al-Lawḥ al-Maḥfūz*), who is Allah Himself. In other words, Allah, who deserves worship and is the only one who knows what is in the Preserved Tablet, is a witness among Muslims and disbelievers in Macca. He punishes the ones who are liars. The reading with a kasrah on *وَمِنْ عِنْدِهِ* (wa min 'indihi) (and from Him) also supports this interpretation."<sup>40</sup> The second recitation provided by Bayḍāwī is the recitation of Ibn al-Samayfā', Ibn Abī 'Ablah (d. 152/769), Mujāhid (d. 103/721), and Abī Ḥayāt (أبي حياة). And according to the narration of Ibn Abī Surayj from al-Kisā'i (d. 189/805) with a kasrah on *مِنْ*, with a kasrah on *عِنْدِهِ* "from Him (مِنْ عِنْدِهِ)".<sup>41</sup>

<sup>34</sup> Bayḍāwī, *Anwār al-tanzil wa-asrār al-ta'wīl*, 3/105.

<sup>35</sup> Zamakhsharī, *al-Kashshāf 'an ḥaqā'iq gavamid at-tanzil wa uyun al-aqawil fi wucūhi't-ta'wīl*, 2/328-329.

<sup>36</sup> al-Ḥusayn ibn Mas'ūd al-Baghawī, *Ma'ālim al-tanzil fi tafsīr al-Qur'ān*, critical ed. 'Abd al-Razzāq al-Mahdī (Beirut: Dār Ihyā' al-Turāth al-'Arabī, 1420), 2/410.

<sup>37</sup> Nasafī, *Madārik al-tanzil wa-ḥaqā'iq al-ta'wīl*, 2/159.

<sup>38</sup> Ṣiddīq Khān al-Qannawī, *Fathu al-bayān fi maqāsid al-Qur'ān* (Beirut: al-Maktabatu al-'Aṣriyah li al-Ṭabā'ah wa al-Nashr, 1412/1992), 7/75.

<sup>39</sup> Nasafī mentions this possibility, too. See: Nasafī, *Madārik al-tanzil wa-ḥaqā'iq al-ta'wīl*, 2/159.

<sup>40</sup> Bayḍāwī, *Anwār al-tanzil wa-asrār al-ta'wīl*, 3/191.

<sup>41</sup> Abū al-Faraj Ibn al-Jawzī, *Zād al-masīr fi 'ilm al-tafsīr*, critical ed. 'Abd al-Razzāq al-Mahdī (Beirut: Dār al-Kitāb al-'Arabī, 1422/2001), 2/502.

### The Recitations of “كَلْبُهُمْ” (kalbuhum) “كَالِبُهُمْ” (kālībuhum) in the Chapter al-Kahf 18/18

Allah, the Most High, has informed the Qur’ân’s reader to comprehend and reflect upon it. He did not inform him / her about the specific location of this cave in any particular land, for there is no benefit or legal significance in knowing it:<sup>42</sup>

“وَحَسْبُهُمْ إِيْقَاطًا وَهُمْ رُفُودٌ وَنُقَلْبُهُمْ ذَاتَ الْيَمِينِ وَذَاتَ الشِّمَالِ وَكَلْبُهُمْ بِأَسْطِ ذِرَاعَيْهِ بِالْوَصِيدِ لَوِ اطَّلَعْتَ عَلَيْهِمْ لَوَلَّيْتَ مِنْهُمْ فِرَارًا وَلَلَّيْنْتَ (مَنْهُمْ رُغْبًا) You would have thought they were awake, but they were actually asleep. We made them turn to the right and left, and their dog (كَلْبُهُمْ) stretched its paws out at the entrance. If you had looked closely, you would have definitely turned away from them in fright, and you would have been filled with awe of them.” (al-Kahf 18/18).

According to Bayḍāwī, the part in the mentioned Qur’ānic verse “their dog (كَلْبُهُمْ),” refers to the dog Aṣḥāb al-Kahf encountered, and it followed them. Even though they tried to drive it away, Allah enabled it to speak. The dog said, “I love Allah’s friends; you sleep, and I will protect you.” Alternatively, the dog they encountered may have belonged to a shepherd. The shepherd was following them, and the dog followed the shepherd. The recitation of “kālībuhum (كَالِبُهُمْ)” also supports this interpretation, as it means the owner of their dogs.<sup>43</sup> Based on the narration from Ja’far ibn Muḥammad al-Ṣādiq (h. 80-148)<sup>44</sup>, some have argued that there were eight individuals among the Companions of the Cave (Aṣḥāb al-Kahf).<sup>45</sup> al-Qurṭubī discusses the recitation of كَالِبُهُمْ and says that it may refer to a man stretching out his arms, placing his palms on the ground, and raising his face to look. This is the stance of a person who tries to hide himself and does not want to be suspected.<sup>46</sup>

#### Conclusion

In conclusion, this study has shed light on the strong relationship between recitation and interpretation in Bayḍāwī’s tafsir, highlighting the dynamic nature of Qur’ānic commentary within the Islamic tradition. Through the interplay of different recitations, Bayḍāwī and other scholars have provided multifaceted insights into the meanings of Qur’ānic verses, enriching our understanding of the Qur’ān.

In Bayḍāwī’s tafsir, it is noteworthy that he does not specify which qirā’a imam or individual he is referring to when he mentions the phrase “And it is supported by the recitation of those who recited. (ويؤيده قراءة من قرأ)”. Such ambiguous transmissions are not unique to Bayḍāwī and can be found in the works of other scholars as well. Bayḍāwī uses this expression a total of six times in his tafsir, with three occurrences in one Medinan surah and one occurrence each in three different Meccan surahs. Additionally, he emphasises that different recitations do not mean that they always contradict.

In future researches, it can be explored whether Bayḍāwī specifically mentioned the recitations of certain qirā’at imams, whether he made preferences among these recitations. Furthermore, the place of recitations that do or do not affect the meaning in Bayḍāwī’s commentary can be examined in broader sense. Moreover, the place of recitation in his tafsir can be analyzed comparatively with other commentaries.

<sup>42</sup> Abū al-Fidā’ Ibn Kathīr, *Tafsīr al-Qur’ān al-‘aẓīm*, critical ed. Sāmī ibn Muḥammad Salāmah (Saudi Arabia: Dār Taybah lil-Nashr wa-al-Tawzī’, 1420–1999), 5/143.

<sup>43</sup> Bayḍāwī, *Anwār al-tanzīl wa-asrār al-ta’wīl*, 3/276.

<sup>44</sup> Abū ‘Abdallāh Muḥammad b. Aḥmad al-Qurṭubī, *al-Jamī‘ li-ahkam al-Qur’ān*, critical ed. Aḥmad al-Baraddūnī - Ibrāhīm Aṭṭafayyish (Cairo: Dar al-Kutub al-Miṣriyah, 1384/1964), 10/373.

<sup>45</sup> Abū al-Thana’ Shihāb al-Dīn al-Alūsī, *Rūḥ al-ma’ānī fī tafsīr al-Qur’ān al-‘aẓīm wa-al-sab’ al-mathānī*, critical ed. ‘Alī ‘Abd al-Bārī ‘Aṭīyah (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-‘Ilmīyah, 1415/1994), 8/234.

<sup>46</sup> Qurṭubī, *al-Jamī‘ li-ahkam al-Qur’ān*, 10/373.

### Bibliography

- Alūsī, Abū al-Thanā' Shihāb al-Dīn. *Rūḥ al-ma'ānī fī tafsīr al-Qur'ān al-'azīm wa-al-sab' al-mathānī*. critical ed. 'Alī 'Abd al-Bārī 'Aṭīyah. 16 Volume. Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyah, 1415/1994.
- Baghawī, al-Ḥusayn ibn Mas'ūd. *Ma'ālim al-tanzīl fī tafsīr al-Qur'ān*. critical ed. 'Abd al-Razzāq al-Mahdī. 5 Volume. Beirut: Dār Iḥyā' al-Turāth al-'Arabī, 1420.
- Bayḍāwī, Nāṣir al-Dīn. *Anwār al-tanzīl wa-asrār al-ta'wīl*. critical ed. Muḥammad 'Abd al-Raḥmān al-Mar'ashlī. 5 Volume. Beirut: Dār Iḥyā' al-Turāth al-'Arabī, 1418.
- Calverley, Edwin Elliott - James W. Pollock (eds.). *Nature Mand and God in Medieval Islam*. 2 Volume. Leiden: Brill, 2002.
- 'Izzat, Darwazah Muḥammad. *al-Tafsīr al-ḥadīth*. 10 Volume. Cairo: Dār Iḥyā' al-Kutub al-'Arabīyah, 1383.
- Ibn al-Jawzī, Abū al-Faraj. *Zād al-masīr fī 'ilm al-tafsīr*. critical ed. 'Abd al-Razzāq al-Mahdī. 4 Volume. Beirut: Dār al-Kitāb al-'Arabī, 1422/2001.
- Ibn 'Ashūr, Muḥammad al-Ṭāhir. *al-Taḥrīr wa-al-tanwīr*. 30 Volume. Tūnis: al-Dār al-Tūnisīyah li al-Nashr, 1984.
- Ibn Kathīr, Abū al-Fidā'. *Tafsīr al-Qur'ān al-'azīm*. critical ed. Sāmī ibn Muḥammad Salāmah. 8 Volume. Saudi Arabia: Dār Ṭaybah lil-Nashr wa-al-Tawzī', 1420–1999.
- Ibn Zanajalah, 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Muḥammad, Abū Zur'ah. *Ḥujjat al-qirā'āt*. critical ed. Sa'īd al-Afghānī. Beirut: Dār al-Risālah, n.d.
- Ibrahim, Lutpi. 'al-Bayḍāwī's Life and Works'. *Islamic Studies* 18/4 (1979), 311–321.
- Kātib Jalabī, Muṣṭafā ibn 'Abd Allāh. *Kashf al-Ẓunūn 'an Asāmī al-Kutub wa-al-Funūn*. 6 Volume. Baghdād: Maktabat al-Muthannā, 1941.
- Khaṭīb, 'Abd al-Karīm Yūnus. *al-Tafsīr al-Qur'ānī li al-Qur'ān*. 16 Volume. Cairo: Dar al-Fikr al-'Arabī, n.d.
- Kiraz, Celil. 'Saçaklızâde Mehmed Efendi'nin Beyzâvî'ye Yönelik Eleştirileri'. *Uludağ Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 15/1 (2006), 319–367.
- Lane, Andrew J. 'You Can't Tell a Book by Its Author: A Study of Mu'tazilite Theology in al-Zamakhsharī's (d. 538/1144) Kashshāf'. *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London* 75/1 (2012), 47–86.
- Maḥallī, Jalāl al-Dīn Muḥammad ibn Aḥmad al- - Suyūṭī, Jalāl al-Dīn 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Abī Bakr. *Tafsīr al-Jalālayn*. Cairo: Dār al-Ḥadīth, n.d.
- Nasafī, Abū al-Barakāt 'Abd Allāh ibn Aḥmad ibn Maḥmūd Ḥāfiẓ al-Dīn. *Madārik al-tanzīl wa-ḥaqā'iq al-ta'wīl*. critical ed. Yūsof 'Alī Badawī. 3 Volume. Beirut: Dār al-Kalim al-Ṭayyib, 1419/1998.
- Nīsābūrī, Nizām al-Dīn al-Ḥasan ibn Muḥammad ibn Ḥusayn al-Qummī. *Gharā'ib al-Qur'ān wa-rahā'ib al-furqān*. critical ed. Zakariyā 'Umayrāt. 6 Volume. Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyah, 1416.
- Qannawjī, Şiddīq Khān. *Faṭḥu al-bayān fī maqāṣid al-Qur'ān*. 15 Volume. Beyrut: al-Maktabatu al-'Aşrīyah li al-Ṭabā'ah wa al-Nashr, 1412/1992.
- Qurtubī, Abū 'Abdallāh Muḥammad b. Aḥmad. *al-Jamī' li-ahkam al-Qur'ān*. critical ed. Aḥmad al-Baraddūnī - Ibrāhīm Aṭṭafayyish. 20 Volume. Cairo: Dar al-Kutub al- Mişrīyah, 2nd Ed., 1384/1964.
- Rāzī, Fakhr al-Dīn. *Mafatih al-ghayb*. 32 Volume. Beirut: Daru lhyai al-Turas al-Arabi, 3rd Ed., 1420/1999.
- Saleh, Walid A. 'The Gloss as Intellectual History: The Ḥāshiyahs on al-Kashshāf'. *Oriens* 41/3/4 (2013), 217–259.
- Shāṭibī, Abū Muḥammad. *Ḥirz al-amānī wa-wajh al-tahānī fī al-qirā'āt al-sab'*. critical ed. Muḥammad Tamīm al-Zu'bī. Damascus: Dār al Ghawthānī li al Dirāsāt al Qur'āniyyah, 1426/2005.
- Suyūṭī, 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Abī Bakr, Jalāl al-Dīn. *Bughyat al-wu'āh fī ṭabaqāt al-lughawīyīn wa-al-nuḥḥāh*. critical ed. Muḥammad Abū al-Faḍl Ibrāhīm. 2 Volume. Lebanon: al-Maktabah al-'Aşrīyah, no date.

- Suyûtî, 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Abī Bakr, Jalāl al-Dīn. *Nawāhid al-abkār wa-shawārid al-afkār*. 3 Volume. Saudi Arabia: Jāmi'at Umm al-Qurā-Kulliyat al-Da'wah wa-Uṣūl al-Dīn, 1424/2005.
- Ṭabarī, Muḥammad ibn Jarīr. *Jāmi' al-bayān fī tafsīr al-Qur'ān*. critical ed. 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abd al-Muḥsin al-Turkī. 26 Volume. Beirut: Dār Hijr lil-Ṭibā'ah wa al-Nashr wa al-Tawzī' wa al-'Ilān, 1422/2001.
- 'Ulaymī, Mujīr al-Dīn ibn Muḥammad. *Faṭḥ al-Raḥmān fī tafsīr al-Qur'ān*. critical ed. Nūr al-Dīn Ṭālib. 7 Volume. Beirut: Dār al-Nawādir, 1430/2009.
- Witherington, Ben. *Torah Old and New Exegesis, Intertextuality, and Hermeneutics*. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2018.
- Zamakhsharī, Abū al-Qāsim Mahmūd ibn 'Umar. *al-Kashshāf 'an ḥaqā'iq gavamid at-tanzīl wa uyun al-aqawil fī vucūhi't-ta'wil*. 4 Volume. Beirut: Dār al-Kitāb al-'Arabī, 3rd Ed., 1407/1986.
- Zuḥaylī, Wahbah ibn Muṣṭafā. *al-Taḥfīz al-munīr fī al-'aqā'idah wa-al-sharī'ah wa-al-manhaj*. 30 Volume. Dimashq: Dār al-Fikr al-Mu'āṣir, 2nd Ed., 1418/1997.
- Zurqāni, Muḥammad 'Abd al-'Azīm. *Manāhil al-'Irfān fī 'ulūm al-Qur'ān*. 2 Volume. Cairo: Maṭba'at 'Īsā al-Bābī al-Ḥalabī wa-Shurakāh, 3rd Ed., n.d.